

This is not correct because whoever is a Bodhisattva on the Mahayana path of accumulation has not necessarily attained an actual concentration whereas in order to attain the physical sublime eye one must have attained an actual concentration. In order to attain the physical sublime eye one must have attained an actual concentration because in order to attain the *celestial* sublime eye one must have attained an actual concentration. In order to attain the *clairvoyance* of the celestial eye one must have attained an actual concentration. (The clairvoyance of the celestial eye will be explained below.)

- Someone says: "The reason is not established (i.e. it is not correct that in order to attain the clairvoyance of the celestial eye one must have attained an actual concentration) because a stream enterer who resides in Sukhavati has attained the clairvoyance of the celestial eye but has not attained an actual concentration. He has attained the clairvoyance of the celestial eye because he has attained the clairvoyance of the celestial eye due to the power of the pure realm. (Please note that 'to attain the clairvoyance of the celestial eye due to the power of the pure realm' means that anyone who is reborn in the pure realm of Sukhavati naturally acquires the clairvoyance of the celestial eye due to special power of that pure realm.)

Our reply is: this was previously refuted.

(Here Panchen Sonam Drakpa says that he previously refuted in his *Decisive Analysis* during the presentation of the four noble truths, that there are stream enterers who reside in Sukhavati – see Handouts 31, page 2 and Handouts 32, page 1 of the autumn course 2011.

The following is the actual refutation from the *Decisive Analysis* that is found in the section on the four noble truths:

- Someone says: "According to the words of the *Sutra on the Field's Array (Sukhavativyuha)* there are stream enterers etc. who reside in Sukhavati."

This is not correct because whoever resides in Sukhavati in the retinue of Amitabha must have necessarily attained an actual concentration. Whoever resides in Sukhavati in the retinue of Amitabha must have necessarily attained an actual concentration because, according to the *Ornament of the Essence*, whoever resides in Sukhavati in the retinue of Amitabha must necessarily possess a clairvoyance.

- Someone says: "There is no pervasion (i.e. even though whoever resides in Sukhavati in the retinue of Amitabha must necessarily possess a *clairvoyance*, this does not mean that whoever resides in Sukhavati in the retinue of Amitabha must have necessarily attained an *actual concentration*) because the meaning of the *Ornament of the Essence* is that anyone who resides in Sukhavati in the retinue of Amitabha has attained a clairvoyance due to the power of the pure realm (without having attained an actual concentration).

There is a pervasion because whoever attained a clairvoyance must have necessarily attained an actual concentration. Whoever attained a clairvoyance must have necessarily attained an actual concentration because it is possible to attain an actual concentration due to the power of the pure realm.

Furthermore, there are no stream enterers who reside in Sukhavati because whoever resides in Sukhavati must necessarily be free from aggregates that are in the nature of suffering and that are produced by contaminated karma and afflictions (whereas a stream enterer possesses such aggregates). Whoever resides in Sukhavati must necessarily be free from aggregates that are in the nature of suffering and that are produced by contaminated karma and afflictions because there is no truth of suffering in Sukhavati. There is no truth of suffering in Sukhavati because the etymology of the term 'pure realm' is that Sukhavati is a realm that is pure, i.e. devoid of the impurity of the truth of suffering.)

Returning to the section of the **Decisive Analysis** that discusses the six clairvoyances, Panchen Sonam Drakpa proceeds by establishing that whoever has attained the path of accumulation has not necessarily attained the physical sublime eye.

Panchen Sonam Drakpa says:

Furthermore, it follows that the Bodhisattva Sadaprarudita had attained the physical sublime eye while he was looking for the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata because, according to you, whoever has attained the path of accumulation has necessarily attained the physical sublime eye.

If you were to assert that the Bodhisattva Sadaprarudita had attained the physical sublime eye while he was looking for the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata it would follow that the Bodhisattva Sadaprarudita knew where the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata was and that the merchant's daughter was to supply him with jewels. If you were to assert the latter (i.e. that the Bodhisattva Sadaprarudita knew where the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata was and that the merchant's daughter was to supply him with jewels), it would contradict the scriptures that say that Sadaprarudita was told by a voice "Go east!" and that say that Sadaprarudita sold his body to Indra who had taken on the body of a Brahmin.

Panchen Sonam Drakpa's debate here relates to a popular story that can be found in the **Perfection of Wisdom Sutras**. It was told by the Buddha to one of his most advanced disciples, Subhuti. The Buddha starts the story by advising Subhuti to seek the **Perfection of Wisdom Sutras** the way the Bodhisattva Sadaprarudita did. He then proceeds by telling Subhuti about the Bodhisattva Sadaprarudita who searched for the **Perfection of Wisdom Sutras** with great determination and diligence, not thinking of his own body and personal gain. Sadaprarudita had heard of the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata who was an expert on teaching the **Perfection of Wisdom Sutras** but since he did not know where to find Dharmodgata grew very distraught and wept day and night. This is the reason for his name Sadaprarudita, or in Tibetan *Tag Tu Ngu*, which literary means 'The One Who Always Cries' or 'Ever-weeping'.

However, one day Sadaprarudita found himself in a remote forest where he heard a mysterious voice that told him "Go east!" Sadaprarudita followed the advice and set off to travel east. But as Sadaprarudita had no possessions, he continued weeping, for he did not have anything to offer to the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata. One of the gods, Indra, was aware of Sadaprarudita's distress and wanting to test the Bodhisattva's resolve emanated as a Brahmin. The Brahmin approached Sadaprarudita and offered to give him jewels and other riches in exchange for parts of his body. Sadaprarudita was so determined to make offerings to Dharmodgata that he stopped weeping, took a sharp knife, and started to cut his skin and flesh to give to the Brahmin. The rich daughter of a merchant witnessed Sadaprarudita's act of mutilation and upon hearing the reason for his sacrifice provided him with the jewels and riches that the Bodhisattva needed. Indra then identified himself and restored the Bodhisattva's body. Thereafter, Sadaprarudita, the merchant's daughter, and five hundred of her maiden girls travelled to the town where the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata resided and received teachings from him on the **Perfection of Wisdom Sutras**.

This completes the presentation of the five sublime eyes according to the **Decisive Analysis**.

Next follow two passages from the **Golden Rosary**:

Since Lama Tsongkhapa's entire presentation of the six clairvoyances in his **Golden Rosary** is very long and difficult to translate, and since the most important points have already been explained according to Gyaltsab je's **Ornament of the Essence**, the following paragraphs are translations of merely two interesting explanations from the **Golden Rosary** that either differ from or are not found in the **Ornament of the Essence**.

The first passage from the **Golden Rosary** explains why the physical sublime eye is limited to distinct objects:

Someone asks: are the objects [of the physical sublime eye] limited to the three-thousand [-fold world system]?

